APPENDIX 4

REQUEST FOR BOARD ACTION

May 11, 2017 Public Business Meeting, 10:00 a.m. - 12:00 p.m.

Brief description of Requested Action: Direct the Technical Director to not proceed to final design and implementation of the proposed scorecard process. The Technical Director shall complete the five pilot programs. Also, this RFBA replaces the previous Board direction contained in the October 11, 2016, RFBA 2017-300-004. In addition, as part of the development of the FY2018 technical work plan, the Technical Director is directed to leverage lessons learned from the development to date of the proposed scorecard process to identify and institutionalize improvements to the independent technical oversight work of the Office of the Technical Director.

The Technical Director shall brief the Board on the scope involved in the five pilot programs, the results of the five pilot programs, the resources necessary both internally and externally, and make recommendations for changes in the work planning process.

Finally, the Technical Director is directed to brief the Board on the specific actions taken on this RFBA, including but not limited to those actions incorporated into the proposed FY2018 technical work plan, by September 30, 2017.

Attachments (init) _____ (included clean version of any proposed document or modified document)

	APRVD	DISAPRVD	ABSTAIN	NOT PARTICPATING	COMMENT	DATE
Joyce L. Connery	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	_____
Jessie H. Roberson	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	_____
Sean Sullivan	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	_____
Daniel J. Santos	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	_____
Bruce Hamilton	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	_____

Final Disposition Summary

Executive Secretary signature _____ Click here to enter a date.

Note: Tabled by vote of the Board to allow the Board to vote on the matter in notational voting. Without objection, the matter shall be provided to the Board in blue folder, and the Board will vote on the matter under the timelines in the Board Procedures, which generally allow three days to vote once the Board receives the folder.

AFFIRMATION OF BOARD VOTING RECORD

SUBJECT: Systematic Safety Oversight

Doc Control#2017-300-061

The Board, with Board Member(s) Jessie H. Roberson, Daniel J. Santos, Joyce L. Connery *approving,* Board Member(s) Sean Sullivan, Bruce Hamilton *disapproving,* Board Member(s) none *abstaining,* and Board Member(s) none *not participating,* have voted to approve the above document on May 17, 2017.

The votes were recorded as:

	APRVD	DISAPRVD	ABSTAIN	NOT PARTICIPATING*	COMMENT	DATE
Sean Sullivan	☐	☒	☐	☐	☐	05/12/17
Bruce Hamilton	☐	☒	☐	☐	☒	05/15/17
Jessie H. Roberson	☒	☐	☐	☐	☐	05/17/17
Daniel J. Santos	☒	☐	☐	☐	☐	05/16/17
Joyce L. Connery	☒	☐	☐	☐	☒	05/16/17

*Reason for Not Participating:

This Record contains a summary of voting on this matter together with the individual vote sheets, views and comments of the Board Members.

Assistant Executive Secretary to the Board

Attachments:
1. Voting Summary
2. Board Member Vote Sheets

cc: Board Members
OGC
OGM Records Officer
OTD

DEFENSE NUCLEAR FACILITIES SAFETY BOARD

NOTATIONAL VOTE RESPONSE SHEET

FROM: **Sean Sullivan**

SUBJECT: **Systematic Safety Oversight**

Doc Control#2017-300-061

Approved_____ **Disapproved** X **Abstain**_____

Recusal – Not Participating_____

COMMENTS: **Below**___ **Attached**____ **None** X

Sean Sullivan

5/12/17

Date

DEFENSE NUCLEAR FACILITIES SAFETY BOARD

NOTATIONAL VOTE RESPONSE SHEET

FROM: **Bruce Hamilton**

SUBJECT: **Systematic Safety Oversight**

Doc Control#2017-300-061

Approved_____ **Disapproved__X__** **Abstain_____**

Recusal – Not Participating_____

COMMENTS: **Below_X__** **Attached____** **None_____**

The Technical Staff originally submitted this RFBA to serve as a refinement of the Board's broad policy guidance for the scorecard process (now being referred to as Systematic Safety Oversight, or SSO). It would have replaced the original guidance for the process directed by RFBA 2017-300-004 of October 11, 2016 with a course of action which the staff saw as more optimal given what they had learned to date. The staff's RFBA was a good one.

Regretfully, the Board Amended the staff's RFBA, deleting the staff's broad policy guidance request, and substituting language directing the staff to proceed only with the five pilot programs currently in progress. This puts the Board in the position of choosing whether to direct the staff to proceed under the original RFBA or to do only five pilot programs and then make more decisions on how or whether to proceed.

The original RFBA was written broadly enough to allow maximum flexibility to the Technical Director in designing the process and defining its scope and scale. Absent this new amended RFBA, the Technical Director will still operate under the original RFBA and will continue to have that same flexibility to design the process. What he submits as a draft directive on July 31, 2017, will be based on the lessons being learned in the five ongoing pilot programs and will reflect what he thinks is the appropriate scope and scale of the program. Consequently, this new amended RFBA does nothing except delay program development and reflect Board equivocation about the effort.

I therefore disapprove.

Bruce Hamilton

15 MAY 2017

Date

DEFENSE NUCLEAR FACILITIES SAFETY BOARD

NOTATIONAL VOTE RESPONSE SHEET

FROM: **Jessie H. Roberson**

SUBJECT: **Systematic Safety Oversight**

Doc Control#2017-300-061

Approved X **Disapproved**_____ **Abstain**_____

Recusal – Not Participating_____

COMMENTS: **Below**___ **Attached**___ **None** X

Jessie H. Roberson

05/17/2017

Date

Cameron Shelton

From: Daniel J. Santos
Sent: Tuesday, May 16, 2017 5:12 PM
To: Cameron Shelton; Shelby Qualls
Subject: RE: Notational Vote: Doc#2017-300-061, Systematic Safety Oversight - BLUE FOLDER

Approved.

From: Cameron Shelton
Sent: Friday, May 12, 2017 12:02 PM
To: Bruce Hamilton [redacted]; Daniel J. Santos [redacted]; Jessie Roberson [redacted]; Joyce Connery [redacted]; Sean Sullivan [redacted]
Cc: Glenn Sklar [redacted]; Katherine Herrera [redacted]; James Biggins [redacted]; Richard Reback [redacted]; Steven Stokes [redacted]; Richard Tontodonato [redacted]; ExSec [redacted]; Adam Poloski [redacted]; Chris Roscetti [redacted]; John Pasko [redacted]; Matt Forsbacka [redacted]
Subject: Notational Vote: Doc#2017-300-061, Systematic Safety Oversight - BLUE FOLDER

This email is an electronic record of Notational Vote. Voting ballot will follow shortly. Also, accepting electronic votes.

DEFENSE NUCLEAR FACILITIES SAFETY BOARD
NOTATIONAL VOTE RESPONSE SHEET

FROM: Members of the Board
SUBJECT: Systematic Safety Oversight

DOC#2017-300-061

Approved_____
Disapproved_____
Abstain_____
Recusal – Not Participating_____

COMMENTS:
Below____
Attached____
None____

Cameron Shelton
Assistant Executive Secretary
Office of the Chairman

DEFENSE NUCLEAR FACILITIES SAFETY BOARD

NOTATIONAL VOTE RESPONSE SHEET

FROM: **Joyce L. Connery**

SUBJECT: **Systematic Safety Oversight**

Doc Control #2017-300-061

Approved_X__ **Disapproved_____** **Abstain_____**

Recusal – Not Participating_____

COMMENTS: **Below_X_** **Attached____** **None_____**

I am supporting this action in order to receive the information that the staff is accumulating for the five pilots within the Safety System Oversight program and to understand the cost/benefit analysis of broadening the use of this methodology. With regard to the reference of internal and external resources, my expectation is that this will simply be a refined view of the information already provided to the Board and that there will be no need to require additional work/information from the Department of Energy to estimate those resources.

I would also like to re-emphasize my view that the methodology developed can be useful in supporting uniformity across oversight reviews and analyzing cross-cutting issues but that full-scale implementation of the model would be too resource intense and would detract from core mission work.

Finally, I do not believe that this tool lends itself to useful public documentation other than as an input to staff reviews that may result in Board products that are then made public as a matter of Board procedure.

Joyce L. Connery

Joyce L. Connery

May 16, 2017

Date